A Comparison of the Narratives in Turkey's 1931–1941 High School History Textbooks with the Qur'an — Appendices

Prof. Dr. Muhammed Fatih Talu
2026-09-21

Abstract. These are the four appendices to the review; each sets out the ground of a group of findings in the main text.

Source text and dataset: https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.21956339
Online version: https://tarih1931.github.io/review.html
Machine-readable claims: https://tarih1931.github.io/inceleme.jsonl
License: CC0-1.0

- **Appendix A — Verse files.** For each verse: where and for what it is used in the findings, the note of the *Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri* on that verse, and the relevant *Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslâm Ansiklopedisi* entry.
- **Appendix B — Term files.** For the nine terms that carry the findings: every use of them within the books, their dictionary meaning in 1931, the shift of meaning, and their Qur'anic counterpart.
- **Appendix C — The preface and the drafting-committee pages.** The full text and the citation lines of the preface and of the drafting-committee pages of the two volumes.
- **Appendix D — The grounds of each judgement.** For every finding: the claim it attributes to the books, the sentences it rests on, and whether that claim comes from the explicit wording or from a combination.

The reference numbers in square brackets (**[1]**, **[15]** and the like) belong to the bibliography of the review. Quotations from the books, the dictionaries and the preface are given in the Turkish of their printing, with an English translation in square brackets beneath.

Appendix A. Verse files

This appendix gives three things for each of the thirty-eight verses cited in the main text: where and for what the verse is used in the findings, the note of the *Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri* **[16]** on that verse, and the relevant *Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslâm Ansiklopedisi* entry. The texts of the verses are not repeated here; in the main text each of them, from Verse-01 to Verse-38, is given word for word from the *Kur'an-ı Kerim Meâli* of the Diyanet İşleri Başkanlığı **[15]**. The commentary notes are summarised from the online edition of the *Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri*, and the encyclopaedia entries were opened and verified in the online edition (accessed: 23 August 2026).

A.1 — Verse-01 · Ash-Shūrā 42/13

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-01 and 02: religion is that which God "ordained as religion" (din kıldığı) for all the prophets; the verb is *sharaʿa*, the agent God.
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** According to almost all commentators, "religion" here covers the divinely given religions in their entirety; what is meant is the rulings common to all of them (first among them tawḥīd). The choice of *waṣṣā* for the other prophets and of *awḥā* for Muhammad underlines his office of prophethood; there is no note on the occasion of revelation or on abrogation.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** DİN ("religion")

A.2 — Verse-02 · Al-Anbiyā' 21/25

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-01: the same tawḥīd was revealed to every prophet; religion is not the outcome of evolution.
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** The purpose of sending prophets is to bring people to believe in the oneness of God and to worship Him alone; the divinely given religions are one in aim and in essence, all of them meeting in the belief in tawḥīd, and this verse is one of the strongest proofs of that. There is no discussion of the occasion of revelation, of abrogation or of lexical meaning.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** TEVHİD ("the oneness of God")

A.3 — Verse-03 · Al-Mā'ida 5/3

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-02: it is God who perfects the religion and who "has chosen it as religion" — the one who lays religion down.
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** "I have perfected your religion" means the perfecting, through the Qur'an, of the religion sent down since Ādam and called Islam in the sight of God (Āl ʿImrān 3/19, 85). On the occasion of revelation: against the reports that it came down at the Farewell Pilgrimage, Ateş holds that it came down much earlier, and Mawdūdī that it came down in the year 6 of the Hijra and was sent down again in the year 10; there is no note on abrogation.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** İSLÂM ("Islam")

A.4 — Verse-04 · Ṭā Hā 20/110

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-03: human knowledge cannot encompass God; divinity is not a concept that the intellect has "found".
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** Verses 105-112 are commented on as a block; no explanation particular to verse 110 is given, and for the impossibility of encompassing God's knowledge the reader is referred to Al-Baqara 2/48, 255. As a lexical discussion the meaning of *haḍm* in verse 112 is recorded (Rāghib treats it as "wrong" by way of metaphor, while the authors preserve the nuance between *ẓulm* and *haḍm*); there is no note on the occasion of revelation or on abrogation.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** ALÎM ("the All-Knowing", among the names of God)

A.5 — Verse-05 · Al-Baqara 2/255

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-03: of His knowledge only as much as He wills is grasped; He is the owner of knowledge and the one who sets its limit.
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** The Verse of the Throne (Āyat al-Kursī) contains the essence of Islamic belief (tawḥīd); the knowledge of every possessor of knowledge other than God is limited. Lexical discussion: *kursī* means "seat, throne" in the dictionary and, figuratively, "sovereignty, dominion"; according to Ibn ʿAbbās it is knowledge, and its true nature is known to God alone (mutashābih). There is no note on the occasion of revelation or on abrogation.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** ÂYETÜ'l-KÜRSÎ ("the Verse of the Throne")

A.6 — Verse-06 · Al-Baqara 2/3

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-04: belief in the unseen is the first attribute of the believer.
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** *Ghayb* is defined as "beings, relations and events that are not seen with the eye and cannot be known through human means of knowledge such as reason and the senses"; God, revelation, destiny, the spirit, the resurrection and the states of the hereafter belong to the realm of the unseen, and the source of knowledge about them is revelation. The commentary reads *bi'l-ghayb* as

the object of faith; there is no note on the occasion of revelation or on abrogation.

- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** GAYB ("the unseen")

A.7 — Verse-07 · Al-Baqara 2/177

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-04: the list of things to be believed in — all of them fall into the class the book counts as "fabrication".
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** *Birr* is one of the most comprehensive concepts of the Qur'an; the four groups of virtues enumerated in the verse — concerning faith, worship, and social and personal morality — are illustrative, not restrictive. The context is an answer to the dispute that arose after the change of the direction of prayer (144-150): formal elements are of no fundamental importance when they are deprived of the essence of faith, worship and morality. There is no note on abrogation.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** İMAN ("faith")

A.8 — Verse-08 · An-Naḥl 16/36

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-05: to every community a messenger proclaiming tawḥīd was sent; tawḥīd is the beginning.
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** "Community" (*umma*) here means a large human group in the general sense; the essence of religion and the chief purpose of sending prophets is tawḥīd, and the essence of servanthood is to avoid every belief and act that would impair it. For *ṭāghūt* the reader is referred to Al-Mā'ida 5/60; there is no note on the occasion of revelation or on abrogation.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** PEYGAMBER ("prophet")

A.9 — Verse-09 · Al-Baqara 2/37

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-05: the first human being is the first addressee of revelation (*talaqqā*).
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** There is no separate discussion of the nature of the "words". The true religions were sent in order to bring order to the conflicting desires and needs of the human being; Ādam's act was either not a sin or was cleansed by the repentance God taught him, and there is no "original sin". There is no note on the occasion of revelation or on abrogation.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** ÂDEM ("Ādam", the prophet)

A.10 — Verse-10 · Al-Anbiyā' 21/30

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-06: life begins from water, but the agent is God.
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** For "they were joined together and We parted them" the three interpretations of the commentators are reported (the heaven and the earth were joined; the heavens and the earth were a single mass; the heaven gave no rain and the earth no plants — Ṭabarī prefers the last), while modern commentaries understand it as the separation of the universe out of a single mass. "We made every living thing from water" indicates that the basis of life rests on water; it is recorded that explaining every verse by scientific theories is not sound. There is no note on the occasion of revelation or on abrogation.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** YARATMA ("creation")

A.11 — Verse-11 · An-Nūr 24/45

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-06: it is God who created every living creature from water.
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** The life-giving water of Al-Anbiyā' 21/30 and the "water" here are different; the second is understood as sperm. Since the sense "each of them from a water proper to itself" also

follows, the conclusion is drawn that the species of living things were created not from a single origin but from different roots (closed to a reading in terms of common descent or evolution). There is no occasion of revelation and no note on abrogation.

- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** HAYAT ("life")

A.12 — Verse-12 · Al-Wāqiʿa 56/57-59

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-07: "is it you who create it, or are We the creator?" — the question of the agent.
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** The group of verses draws attention to God's power of creation by asking, of the human being's own existence and immediate surroundings (semen, crops, water, fire), "of what will and what power are all these beings and events the work". For 57-59 no embryological detail is given and no creation-versus-evolution discussion is entered into; the meanings of *shajara* (the tree that yields fire) and *tadhkira* (reminder) are given. There is no note on the occasion of revelation or on abrogation.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** İNSAN ("the human being")

A.13 — Verse-13 · Al-Mu'minūn 23/12-14

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-07: a graded creation from an essence of clay; the agent of every grade is God.
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** *Sulāla* means in the dictionary "a thing drawn out from within something"; since what is meant is the substances found in the soil that make up the body, "not only the first human being but the origin of the existence of all other human beings too is from earth". *Nutfa* is the zygote, *ʿalaqa* the embryo clinging to the womb, *muḍgha* a shapeless piece of flesh. There is no creation-versus-evolution discussion, no occasion of revelation and no note on abrogation.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** İNSAN ("the human being")

A.14 — Verse-14 · As-Sajda 32/7-9

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-08: a creation that begins with clay, continues from an essence of water, is given form and has the spirit breathed into it — the agent is God.
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** To say "the spirit of God" is an ascription of honour, like calling the Kaʿba "the house of God"; understanding it as a part would contradict His essence and attributes. The worth of the human being comes from his Lord's having given him worth. In verse 7 there is no explanation concerning Ādam, species or evolution, no occasion of revelation and no note on abrogation.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** RUH ("the spirit")

A.15 — Verse-15 · Al-Infiṭār 82/6-8

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-08: it is God who creates the human being, gives him form, proportions him and composes him in whatever shape He wills.
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** The human being owes it to his Lord that he is endowed with bodily and mental faculties and comes into the world as a well-formed human being. "Proportioning" is the harmonious creation of the body and the faculties, and "He composed you as He willed" is the dependence of creation on God's will. There is no interpretation in terms of creation or evolution, no occasion of revelation and no note on abrogation.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** İNSAN ("the human being")

A.16 — Verse-16 · An-Najm 53/3-4

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-09: revelation is the definitive ruling the Qur'an gives in its own voice; the Prophet does not speak out of caprice.
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** The scope of "he does not speak out of caprice" is disputed: against the view that "everything he says is revelation" stands the fact that the Prophet has utterances that involve his own judgement; the commentary concludes that his words and acts outside the proclamation of the message were also under the control of revelation. The real purpose is a refutation of the polytheists who counted him a poet or a soothsayer (the context of revelation); the pronoun "it" refers back to the Qur'an, and there is no note on abrogation.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** VAHİY ("revelation")

A.17 — Verse-17 · Ash-Shūrā 42/52

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-09: before revelation the Prophet did not know "what the Book was, what faith was" — the refutation of a "religion he found himself".
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** "You did not know": recalling that the verb *darā* expresses coming to know a truth, this is understood to mean that before revelation the Prophet did not know the content of the Book or the truth of faith; this does not mean that he was not a believer. How God is to be worshipped can be known only through revelation. There is no occasion of revelation and no note on abrogation.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** VAHİY ("revelation"); RUH ("the spirit")

A.18 — Verse-18 · Al-Muddaththir 74/18-29

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-10: the description "the word of a human being" (*qawl al-bashar*) is named in the Qur'an, rejected, and its consequence stated — Saqar follows immediately upon the characterisation (74/26-29).
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** Occasion of revelation: the polytheists asked al-Walīd b. al-Mughīra how they should oppose the Prophet and the Qur'an; al-Walīd said, and spread the claim, that the Prophet was a magician and the Qur'an a piece of magic handed down from the magicians of old. The deniers counted the Qur'an "the word of a human being". There is no note on abrogation, and the question of inimitability is not taken up directly. Verses 26-29 state what the characterisation incurs: Saqar is one of the names of Hell, and the commentary describes it as sparing nothing and leaving nothing, and scorching the skin.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** VELÎD b. MUGĪRE (al-Walīd b. al-Mughīra)

A.19 — Verse-19 · Al-Ḥāqqa 69/41-43

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-10: the Qur'an is not the word of a poet or a soothsayer but a sending down from the Lord of the worlds — the refutation of the book's model of poetic inspiration.
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** Against the polytheists' charge of poet or soothsayer, God declares on oath that the Qur'an is not the word of a poet or a soothsayer but "the word of a noble messenger", and that it was sent down from the Lord of the worlds. The "noble messenger" is, according to the majority, the Prophet, and in At-Takwīr 81/19 Gabriel; both are intermediaries. There is no occasion of revelation and no note on abrogation.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** KÂHİN ("soothsayer")

A.20 — Verse-20 · Yūnus 10/16

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-10: "a lifetime" before revelation — the counterpart to the claim of

"years of reflection".

- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** The setting of revelation is the demand for a change made in verse 15; the answer rests on the fact that the style of someone who has lived among them for years can easily be told apart from the wholly different content and style of the Qur'an. The verse is extremely clear that the Prophet had no contribution to and no influence upon either the wording or the content of the Qur'an. There is no discussion of abrogation or of ambiguity.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** VAHİY ("revelation")

A.21 — Verse-21 · Al-Mā'ida 5/67

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-11: the command to proclaim; the Prophet is not a founder but a bearer of the message.
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** The duty of proclamation cannot be limited according to the attitude of those addressed; according to the majority, the clause "you will not have conveyed" means "if you fail to convey even a part of it, you are counted as not having conveyed it at all", and it refutes the claims (of some Shīʿīs and Bāṭinīs) that the Prophet concealed a part of the revelation. The authenticity of the reports of revelation attached to the clause "God will protect you from people" is open to criticism (Darwaza); there is no discussion of abrogation.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** TEBLİĞ ("the conveying of the message"); PEYGAMBER ("prophet")

A.22 — Verse-22 · Al-Aʿrāf 7/157

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-11: "unlettered" (ümmî) is a title in the Qur'an.
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** There are three views on *ummī*: "of Mecca", by relation to Umm al-Qurā; "of the Arab nation", by relation to *umma*; and, by relation to *umm* (mother), one who cannot read or write, "as he was born of his mother" (Ibn ʿAṭiyya). The commentary adopts the last view: the word expresses that the Prophet could not read or write, "at least in the beginning", and that he received his knowledge of religion from God alone. The option "not being of the People of the Book" is not counted, and the note on abrogation concerns only the lifting of certain severe rulings in Judaism.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** ÜMMÎ ("unlettered")

A.23 — Verse-23 · Al-ʿAnkabūt 29/48

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-11: being unlettered is the proof of the independence of revelation from human accumulation.
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** Reading and writing are the two fundamental ways of receiving instruction; the verse states that the Prophet received no such instruction, since otherwise the deniers could have claimed that he had taken the Qur'an from a member of the People of the Book. Being unlettered is qualified as covering "at least" the thirteen years of the Meccan period (the possibility of his writing later is left open); the word is not discussed again, and there is no occasion of revelation and no abrogation.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** ÜMMÎ ("unlettered")

A.24 — Verse-24 · Ṭā Hā 20/13-14

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-12: Mūsā is the one who is chosen and the one to whom revelation is given.
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** Mūsā is the prophet most often spoken of in the Qur'an; that the account begins directly with the giving of the office of prophethood is connected with the sūra's aim of consoling the

Messenger of God. The part of verse 14 "perform the prayer to keep Me in remembrance" has also been given the sense "perform the prayer when you remember", but Ṭabarī found the first sense the stronger one according to the wording. There is no discussion of the occasion of revelation or of abrogation.

- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** MÛSÂ ("Mūsā", the prophet)

A.25 — Verse-25 · Al-Aʿrāf 7/145

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-12: it is God who writes the tablets — the refutation of "he laid down the principles of his own religion".
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** As an explanation of the "messages" of the preceding verse, the verse indicates that the Torah was sent down as texts written on tablets; *alwāḥ* is the plural of *lawḥ*, "a rectangular board", and what is meant is the stone tablets on which the revelations given to Mūsā were written (Exodus 24/12). "Let them take the best of it" has been interpreted in different ways (Ibn ʿAṭiyya), and four views are reported on "the abode of those who have gone astray"; there is no occasion of revelation and no abrogation.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** TEVRAT ("the Torah")

A.26 — Verse-26 · Ar-Raḥmān 55/15

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-13: the jinn are a created kind of being.
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** Verses 14-15, by declaring the principal elements in the first creation of human beings and of the jinn, draw attention to the fact that God, who knows their nature, is the sole creator. *Mārij* means in the dictionary "shaking, not staying in place" and "mixing, mixer"; on the first sense it has been explained as "pure smokeless flame", on the second as "mingling, penetrating smoky fire". There is no occasion of revelation and no abrogation.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** CİN ("the jinn")

A.27 — Verse-27 · Al-Jinn 72/1-2

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-13: the source of knowledge about the jinn is revelation ("it has been revealed to me (…)").
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** *Jinn* is a noun from the verb *janna*, "to cover, to remain hidden"; as a technical term it is a kind of being created from fire, not perceptible by the senses, possessed of consciousness and will. Occasion of revelation: a group of the jinn listened to the Qur'an and, returning to their people, declared that they had believed; the Prophet did not see them, and the matter was made known to him by revelation. There is no abrogation.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** CİN ("the jinn")

A.28 — Verse-28 · Al-Baqara 2/285

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-14: belief in the angels is one of the enumerated articles of faith.
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** At the beginning of the sūra the qualities of those who believe are enumerated, and at its end God's confirmation of the faith of the Messenger and the believers in God, His angels, His books and His prophets is presented as an incomparable mark of favour; for the making of no distinction among the prophets the reader is referred to Al-Baqara 2/136. The nature of the concept of the angel is not discussed on this page (the remainder is a discussion, by way of verse 286, of the imposition of what is beyond capacity and of destiny). There is no occasion of revelation and no abrogation.

- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** MELEK ("angel")

A.29 — Verse-29 · An-Naḥl 16/102-103

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-14: it is the Holy Spirit who brought the Qur'an down; the charge that "a human being is teaching him" is named and rejected.
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** What is meant by "the Holy Spirit" is Gabriel; the impossibility of the Qur'an's being dictated by a foreigner shows the absurdity of the claim. Reports on the occasion of revelation: the person said to have taught him was a Meccan swordsmith of the People of the Book named Balʿam, or a Christian slave named Yaʿīsh or Jabr; these are worth no more than conjecture, and the report about Salmān the Persian is baseless, since Salmān became a Muslim in Medina. There is no abrogation.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** RÛHULKUDÜS ("the Holy Spirit")

A.30 — Verse-30 · Al-Baqara 2/127

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-15: it is Ibrāhīm and Ismāʿīl who raise the foundations of the Kaʿba.
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** From the expression "he was raising the foundations" the commentators infer that a building had earlier stood on the site of the Kaʿba (ruined in the flood of Nūḥ) and that Ibrāhīm raised the structure upon the old foundations; the reports that the first building belonged to the angels or to Ādam are also transmitted (Ṭabarī). Ṭabarī states that there is no certain knowledge on the matter, while Rashīd Riḍā counts these reports Isrāʾīliyyāt and holds that Ibrāhīm built the Kaʿba for the first time. No occasion of revelation, abrogation or variant reading is mentioned.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** KÂBE ("the Kaʿba")

A.31 — Verse-31 · Al-Ḥajj 22/26

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-15: it is God who appointed the site of the Kaʿba for Ibrāhīm.
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** The verse recalls that the Kaʿba has been a place of common worship since the time of Ibrāhīm; the part rendered "when We settled" has also been given the senses "when We showed the place" and "when We prepared the place" (Shawkānī). The dispute over whether verse 25 came down in Mecca or in Medina is reported; abrogation is not mentioned.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** KÂBE ("the Kaʿba")

A.32 — Verse-32 · Al-Mā'ida 5/97

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-16: it is God who made the Kaʿba, the sacred month and the offering of the pilgrimage an order for people.
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** Verse 97 is not separately explained; the reader is referred to Al-Mā'ida 5/1-2. Note on abrogation: the views that the ruling of Al-Mā'ida 2, "do not attack those who have set out for the Sacred House", was abrogated (Ibn al-ʿArabī, Ibn Kathīr, Elmalılı) and that it was not abrogated (Elmalılı, Ateş) are transmitted side by side; for Al-Mā'ida 2 a report on the occasion of revelation concerning Ḥuṭam b. Hind al-Bakrī is given.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** KÂBE ("the Kaʿba"); HARAM AYLAR ("the sacred months")

A.33 — Verse-33 · Al-Baqara 2/125

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-16: it is God who made the Kaʿba a place of assembly and of safety.
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** The verse declares that the Kaʿba was made a place of pilgrimage visited again and again and a place of safety. The Station of Ibrāhīm is the stone on which Ibrāhīm is believed to

have stood while building the Kaʿba, or the place of that stone (Rāzī); who is addressed by the command to take the station as a place of prayer is disputed (the community of Muhammad, or the people of Ibrāhīm). There is no occasion of revelation, abrogation or variant reading.

- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** MAKĀM-ı İBRÂHİM ("the Station of Ibrāhīm"); KÂBE ("the Kaʿba")

A.34 — Verse-34 · Yūnus 10/15

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-17: the Prophet cannot change the revelation of his own accord.
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** The polytheists' demand that the Qur'an be changed is self-contradictory; had the Prophet done so, he would have fallen into the position of a liar in his claim that the Qur'an came from God. The verse is "extremely clear" that the Prophet had no contribution to the wording or the content of the Qur'an; no relation is drawn between alteration (*tabdīl*) and abrogation, and abrogation, ambiguity, variant readings and the occasion of revelation are not mentioned.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** NESİH ("abrogation", in Islamic law)

A.35 — Verse-35 · Al-Anʿām 6/115

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-17: the word of your Lord is complete; there is none who can change it.
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** *Ṣidq* is truthfulness in word and in deed, *ʿadl* conformity to the rules of right and equity. Four qualities of God's speech are indicated: that it is complete, true, just, and "incapable of being changed or corrupted". Abrogation, ambiguity, the occasion of revelation and the variant reading *kalima*/*kalimāt* are not mentioned.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** NESİH ("abrogation", in Islamic law)

A.36 — Verse-36 · Al-Kahf 18/110

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-18: the measure that distinguishes the Prophet from other human beings is revelation.
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** Muhammad is beyond doubt a human being; it is not possible for him to encompass all of God's knowledge, he knows only what is revealed to him, and one of the things revealed to him is the truth that the god of all human beings is one god. For the second half, hidden or lesser polytheism in the form of ostentation is expounded alongside open polytheism; the word "human being" (*bashar*) is not dwelt upon, and there is no discussion of the occasion of revelation, of abrogation or of variant readings.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** İNSAN ("the human being")

A.37 — Verse-37 · Aṭ-Ṭūr 52/33-34

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-19: the charge that "he made it up himself", and the challenge.
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** The deniers' claim that "he made it up himself" is taken up; the clause *bal lā yu'minūn* may also be given the sense "they themselves do not believe (what they say)" (Elmalılı). For the challenge the reader is referred to Al-Baqara 2/23 ("a discourse like that which is in it" was demanded, and it could not be produced: inimitability); the occasion of revelation attached to verse 30 should be counted a reference, since the sūra came down as a whole (Ateş). Abrogation is not mentioned.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** İ'CÂZÜ'l-KUR'ÂN ("the inimitability of the Qur'an"); TEHADDÎ ("the challenge")

A.38 — Verse-38 · Yūnus 10/37

- **Place in the findings.** Finding-19: the Qur'an cannot be made up by any other than God — the explicit wording of the twofold classification.
- **Kur'an Yolu Tefsiri.** The verse is an answer to the claim that "Muhammad made the Qur'an up". Lexical discussion: some understand "the Book" as the earlier books, while Ṭabarī and Zamakhsharī understand it as "the rulings God has written down and made obligatory for the community of Muhammad" (the commentary's own rendering follows the second view); at Yūnus 38 the verses of challenge are enumerated. There is no occasion of revelation, abrogation or variant reading.
- **TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi.** İ'CÂZÜ'l-KUR'ÂN ("the inimitability of the Qur'an")

Appendix B. Term files

This appendix brings together, for the key terms that carry the findings, every use of them in the books, their dictionary meaning in 1931 and their counterpart in the Qur'an. The counts were made on the hand-corrected full text of the two sections, headings included; the example sentences are word for word and have been machine-checked against the page named in their citation. The dictionary definitions are taken word for word from the *Kubbealtı Lugatı* **[18]** and, from the *Kamus-ı Türkî* (1317/1901) **[19]**, by reading the facsimile image; the second should be confirmed against a printed copy. The verses given as Qur'anic counterparts have been checked against the Turkish rendering used by the review.

B.1 — ilham / vahiy / mülhem (inspiration / revelation / inspired)

- **In the books.** *ilham*: 9 (I p. 23; II pp. 90 (4), 91 (4)); *vahiy*: 5 (II pp. 90, 91; two of them headings); *mülhem*: 4 (II pp. 80, 91, 117, 158). The books treat "ilham" as the genus and "vahiy" as its species: on p. 90 revelation is explained as "that is, inspiration" and is a "thought" that has "arisen" after reflection; the same word is used for the inspiration given by the jinn to soothsayers and poets. In all four of its occurrences "mülhem" carries the worldly sense "inspired". A divine source is never affirmed in the books' own voice; the "divine power" on p. 91 is something Muhammad "sincerely believed in".
- **Examples.** *Tarih II, p. 90*: "İslâm an'anesinde bu ayetlerin Muhammede Cebrail adında bir melek vasıtasile Allah tarafından vahiy, yani ilham edildiği kabul olunur." [In Islamic tradition it is accepted that these verses were revealed — that is, inspired — to Muhammad by God through an angel named Gabriel.] — *Tarih II, p. 91*: "Dinler nazarında cinler, kötü ruhlar olduğundan peygamberler onlardan mülhem olamazlardı." [In the view of the religions, since the jinn were evil spirits, the prophets could not be inspired by them.]
- **Dictionary.** Kubbealtı *ilham* 1: "Ruhta meydana gelen ve yaratıcılığa iten coşku, içe doğma, esin." [The exaltation that arises in the soul and drives one to creation; an inward prompting, inspiration.] Kamus-ı Türkî *ilhâm* 1: "Hak Taâlâ ibâdının kalbine bir şey ilkā etme" [God Most High casting something into the heart of His servants]; *vahy*: "Bir fikir veya emrin min tarafillâh bir peygambere ilhâm olunması" [A thought or a command being inspired, on God's part, to a prophet] and "[Evliyâya olursa ilhâm denilir.]" [If it is to a saint, it is called ilhâm.]
- **Shift of meaning.** Present: in 1901 the *Kamus-ı Türkî* defines "ilhâm" only in the divine sense and makes the difference from revelation turn on the recipient; the worldly sense "inspiration", which the *Kubbealtı* places first, became established in late Ottoman literary usage. The books use this worldly, animistic sense and, by means of "that is", fit it onto revelation, dropping the dictionary's qualifications "on God's part" and "to a prophet".
- **Qur'anic counterpart.** *waḥy* (و-ح-ي) — God's hidden and swift communication to His prophet. An-

Najm 53/4 "in huwa illā waḥyun yūḥā" ‖ *ilhām* (ل-ه-م) — casting into the heart; its single occurrence in the Qur'an is the innate intuition given to the soul. Ash-Shams 91/8 "fa-alhamahā fujūrahā wa-taqwāhā"

- **Overlap.** Weak: the Qur'an distinguishes *waḥy* from *ilhām*; the books' jinn→poet/soothsayer inspiration is precisely the field the Qur'an excludes by name in saying "the word of a poet / the word of a soothsayer" (Al-Ḥāqqa 69/41-42). What a referee might say: the equation "revelation, that is, inspiration" is legitimate in Ottoman lexicography — the answer: the dictionary makes it with the qualifications "on God's part" and "to a prophet", whereas the books drop the qualifications and place inspiration in the same genus as the inspiration of jinn and poets; the difference lies not in the word but in the source and in the recipient.

B.2 — uydurma / masal / hikâye / hurafe / efsane / gûya (fabrication / tale / story / superstition / legend / supposedly)

- **In the books.** *uydur-*: 6 (I pp. 2, 7; II pp. 85, 89); *masal*: 1 (II p. 85); *hikâye*: 4 (I pp. 3, 23); *hurafe*: 1 (I p. 23, a heading); *efsane*: 1 (II p. 91); *gûya*: 5 (I p. 23; II pp. 84-136). The books use a single vocabulary for religious narratives: the narrative in books of religion is a "story" (p. 3); the attribution of the Kaʿba to Ibrāhīm is "fabrication" and "tale" (p. 85); the accounts of the Prophet's life are "fabricated things" (p. 89); the reports of prophethood are "mixed with legends" (p. 91); and "supposedly" marks the claim the books do not believe. The principle is on p. 2: for the human mind all supernatural concepts are "fabricated things".
- **Examples.** *Tarih I, p. 3*: "Bu kanaatler hep din kitaplarındaki hikâyelerin olduğu gibi hakikat sanılmasından doğuyordu." [These convictions all arose from the stories in books of religion being taken for truth just as they stood.] — *Tarih I, p. 23*: "HİKÂYE VE HURAFELER" [TALES AND SUPERSTITIONS] — *Tarih II, p. 85*: "Bunların hepsi, bittabi, soradan uydurulmuş masallardır." [All of these are, naturally, tales fabricated afterwards.]
- **Dictionary.** Kubbealtı *hurâfe*: "dinde olmadığı halde sonradan uydurulmuş, asılsız, gerçekle alâkası bulunmayan bâtıl inanç, efsâne, hikâye, rivâyet vb." [A false belief, legend, story, report and the like, fabricated afterwards although it is not part of religion, without foundation and with no connection to reality.] Kamus-ı Türkî *hurâfât*: "Edyân-ı kâzibe-i kadîme i'tikādât-ı bâtılasından kalma hârikulâde hikâyât-ı garîbe, esâtîr" [Strange and marvellous stories left over from the false beliefs of the old false religions; myths]; *hikâye* 2: "Hakîkî veya uydurma ve ekseriyâ hisse kapmağa mahsus sergüzeşt ve vukūât, kıssa, mesel (masal)." [True or invented adventures and events, mostly meant to convey a moral; a narrative, a parable (tale).]
- **Shift of meaning.** Almost none: "uydurma", "masal", "efsane" and "gûya" occupy the same field in 1901, in 1931 and today; "hurafe" has narrowed today to "superstition". The striking point is that the *Kamus-ı Türkî* defines "hurâfât" by way of "esâtîr" — the word the Qur'an uses in "the myths of the ancients" — and defines "masal" as the Turkish form of "mesel" ("mesel (masal)").
- **Qur'anic counterpart.** *iftirā* (ي-ر-ف) — to concoct what has no basis and ascribe it (to God). Yūnus 10/38 "am yaqūlūna'ftarāhu"; Yūsuf 12/111 "mā kāna ḥadīthan yuftarā" ‖ *asāṭīr al-awwalīn* (ر-ط-س) — the written tales of the ancients. An-Naḥl 16/24 "qālū asāṭīr al-awwalīn"; Al-Anʿām 6/25 "in hādhā illā asāṭīr al-awwalīn"
- **Overlap.** Strong: the books' vocabulary of "fabrication" lies in the same field as the charge of *iftirā* that the Qur'an transmits from the deniers, and the cluster "tale/legend/superstition" in the same field as *asāṭīr al-awwalīn*. The referee's objection: p. 85 targets a tradition, p. 89 the biography of the Prophet, p. 3 the chronology of the Torah, and the Qur'an itself is nowhere called "fabrication" — this is correct; but p. 85, by saying "all of these", takes the content of Al-Baqara 2/127 into the cluster, and the rule on p. 2 covers all supernatural concepts.

B.3 — müessis / müessese / kurmak / tesis / koymak / vücuda getirmek (founder / institution / to found / establishment / to lay down / to bring into being)

- **In the books.** *müessis*: 2 (II pp. 91, 93); *müessese*: 11 (I p. 24; II pp. 82-165); *kur-*: 48 (I pp. 8-23; II pp. 79-183); *tesis*: 17, *teessüs*: 14, *koy-*: 12 (4 in I pp. 9-22; 39 in II pp. 80-179); *vücuda getir-*: 22 (I pp. 2-24; II pp. 87-182). The books use the same family of words indifferently for the state, the city, the community, the sect and religion (the principle: p. 24); "müessis" occurs only for Muhammad (p. 91, "the founder of a universal religion"; p. 93, "founder of a religion"). The formula "to lay down its principles" is the same for Mūsā, Muhammad, Musaylima, al-Muʿtaṣim and Mālik b. Anas (pp. 80, 90, 112, 160, 170).
- **Examples.** *Tarih II, p. 79*: "A. İSLÂM DİNİ ARABİSTANDA KURULDU" [A. THE RELIGION OF ISLAM WAS FOUNDED IN ARABIA] — *Tarih I, p. 24*: "Görülüyor ki insanlar cemaat halinde yaşamıya başladıktan sora, diğer içtimaî müesseseler gibi din müessesesini de vücuda getirmişlerdir." [It is seen that after people began to live in communities they brought into being the institution of religion as well, like the other social institutions.] — *Tarih II, p. 90*: "Muhammedin koyduğu esasların toplu olduğu kitaba Kuran denir." [The book in which the principles laid down by Muhammad are collected is called the Qur'an.]
- **Dictionary.** Kubbealtı *müessis*: "Bir müessese veya binânın temelini atan, kuran kimse, kurucu." [One who lays the foundation of an institution or a building; a founder.] Kamus-ı Türkî *müessis* 2: "Kuran, vücûda getiren: müessis-i devlet; bu usûlün müessisi." [One who founds, who brings into being: the founder of a state; the founder of this method.]
- **Shift of meaning.** None: "müessis/kurucu" was neutral in 1901 as it is today, and in 1931 "din müessisi" is the equivalent of European historiography's "Religionsstifter". The weight lies in religion's being placed in the class of "social institutions", in its being joined to "what he found himself", and in the model of proclamation being declared an "error" on p. 93.
- **Qur'anic counterpart.** *sharaʿa* (ش-ر-ع) — to ordain as law or religion. Ash-Shūrā 42/13 "sharaʿa lakum mina'd-dīni mā waṣṣā bihī Nūḥan wa'lladhī awḥaynā ilayka"; Ash-Shūrā 42/21 "am lahum shurakā'u sharaʿū lahum mina'd-dīni mā lam ya'dhan bihi'llāh" ‖ *ballagha* (ب-ل-غ) — to convey, to proclaim. Al-Mā'ida 5/67 "yā ayyuha'r-rasūlu balligh mā unzila ilayka min Rabbik"
- **Overlap.** Strong, with opposite agents: "to found" is matched in the Qur'an by the verb "sharaʿa ... mina'd-dīn", and the agent is Muhammad and human beings in the books but God in the Qur'an; Ash-Shūrā 42/21 condemns the founding of a religion by human beings. The referee's objection: "müessis is a neutral term; in the methodology of Islamic law the Prophet is also called *Shāriʿ*" — the answer: the attribute *Shāriʿ* in that discipline is bound to the authority of proclamation and revelation, whereas the books count the model of proclamation an "error" on p. 93 and describe the religion on p. 89 as one "he found himself".

B.4 — an'ane (tradition)

- **In the books.** *an'ane*: 8 (I pp. 22 (2), 23; II pp. 85 (4), 90). In the books a tradition is invented (p. 22), arises out of stories and restricts free thought (p. 23), and its content is an attribution not confirmed by history, in the same chain as fabrication and tale (p. 85: "Arab tradition ... attributes" → "according to these fabrications" → "are tales"). After this chain, the note on p. 90, "in Islamic tradition ... it is accepted", means, in the books' own vocabulary, an acceptance not confirmed by history; it is set against "from the historical point of view", and tradition is never mentioned again.
- **Examples.** *Tarih II, p. 85*: "Arap an'anesi kâbenin inşasını İbrahim Peygambere atfetmektedir." [Arab tradition attributes the building of the Kaʿba to the prophet Ibrāhīm.] — *Tarih II, p. 90*: "İslâm an'anesinde bu ayetlerin Muhammede Cebrail adında bir melek vasıtasile Allah tarafından vahiy, yani ilham edildiği kabul olunur." [In Islamic tradition it is accepted that these verses were revealed — that

is, inspired — to Muhammad by God through an angel named Gabriel.]

- **Dictionary.** Kubbealtı *an'ane* 1: "Nesilden nesile geçerek gelen âdet, örf, gelenek [Kelime bu anlamı Türkçe'de kazanmıştır]." [A custom, usage or tradition passed down from generation to generation (the word acquired this sense in Turkish).]; 2: "Ağızdan ağıza nakledilerek gelen rivâyet." [A report transmitted from mouth to mouth.] Kamus-ı Türkî *an'ane* 1: "Hadîs-i şerîf ve sâir nakliyâtın «an fülân an fülân» diyerek isnâdı, rivâyetin teselsülü" [The attribution of a noble hadith or other transmitted matter by saying "from so-and-so, from so-and-so"; the chain of transmission.]
- **Shift of meaning.** Present and marked: in 1901 *an'ane* means only the chain of transmission of a hadith; the word acquired the sense "tradition" (Fr. *tradition*) in Turkish later (as the *Kubbealtı* records), and the 1931 books use it in that sense. In 1931 "İslâm an'anesi" means "Islamic tradition" — not a chain of transmission but an acceptance inherited by a community.
- **Qur'anic counterpart.** *mā alfaynā / mā wajadnā ʿalayhi ābā'anā* (ل-ف-و / و-ج-د) — the way we found our fathers upon. Al-Baqara 2/170 "bal nattabiʿu mā alfaynā ʿalayhi ābā'anā"; Az-Zukhruf 43/22-23 "innā wajadnā ābā'anā ʿalā ummatin wa-innā ʿalā āthārihim muhtadūn" ‖ *tanzīl* (ن-ز-ل) — a sending down; the Qur'an's own word for its own source. Ash-Shuʿarā' 26/192 "tanzīlu Rabbi'l-ʿālamīn"
- **Overlap.** Structural rather than verbal: the word "an'ane" does not occur in the Qur'an; the Qur'an does not count an acceptance inherited from the fathers a proof, and the books likewise count tradition something invented that restricts thought. The divergence is that the books place the divine character of revelation in the category of tradition (p. 90), whereas the Qur'an gives it as its own declaration (*tanzīl*). What a referee might say: "'it is accepted in Islamic tradition' is the historian's customary note of neutrality" — the answer: the chain tradition → fabrication → tale on p. 85 does not leave the word neutral; and in 1931 the word means "tradition", not a chain of transmission.

B.5 — telâkki (conception, receiving)

- **In the books.** *telâkki*: 13 (I pp. 1 (a heading), 19, 23 (2), 24; II pp. 80, 91 (2), 106, 116, 117, 156, 160). As a noun, "telâkki" is a conception adopted by a community and making no claim to truth: the conceptions of primitive man are set against "the truths of today" (the heading on p. 1); sacrifice takes on "the character of a general conception" (p. 23); the mind was "gradually accustomed" to "comprehensive conceptions" (p. 24); Mūsā lays down his religion "inspired by the conceptions" of Midian (p. 80); in earlier religions there is a "conception of jinn and angels" (p. 91). As a verb, "telâkki etmek/olunmak" means "to count, to regard" (pp. 91, 116, 117, 160).
- **Examples.** *Tarih I, p. 1*: "İLK İNSANLARIN İPTİDAÎ TELÂKKİLERİ VE BUGÜNKÜ HAKİKATLER" [THE PRIMITIVE CONCEPTIONS OF THE FIRST HUMAN BEINGS AND THE TRUTHS OF TODAY] — *Tarih II, p. 80*: "Musa gençliğinde uzun müddet Medyen de bulunmuş ve buradaki telâkkilerden mülhem olarak kendi dininin esaslarını koymuştur." [Mūsā spent a long time in Midian in his youth and, inspired by the conceptions there, laid down the principles of his own religion.]
- **Dictionary.** Kubbealtı *telakkî* 1: "Belli bir bakış açısına göre görme, bakma, kendine göre bir fikir sâhibi olma, görüş, anlayış." [Seeing or regarding from a particular point of view, forming one's own opinion; a view, an understanding.]; 2: "Kabul etme, alma." [Accepting, receiving.] Kamus-ı Türkî *telakkî* 1: "Alma, kabul etme" [Receiving, accepting]; 2: "Bir suretle kabul etme veya bir gûne nazarla bakma" [Accepting in a certain way, or regarding with a certain view]
- **Shift of meaning.** Almost none: in 1901 the first sense is "receiving, accepting" and the second "regarding with a certain view"; today "understanding, view" has come to the fore and the sense "receiving" has receded (the order in the *Kubbealtı* is reversed). "Inspired by the conceptions" on p. 80 also carries the 1901 sense of "receiving": what was taken from Midian.
- **Qur'anic counterpart.** *talaqqā / tulaqqā* (ل-ق-ي) — to meet and receive; to receive (revelation). Al-

Baqara 2/37 "fa-talaqqā Ādamu min Rabbihī kalimātin" (Diyanet: "Ādam received certain words from his Lord (by way of revelation)"); An-Naml 27/6 "wa-innaka la-tulaqqa'l-Qur'āna min ladun Ḥakīmin ʿAlīm"

- **Overlap.** Verbally exact (the same root, the same sense of "receiving"), with opposite sources: in the books a conception is received from the surroundings (Midian, the primitive tribe, earlier religions) and makes no claim to truth, whereas in the Qur'an what is received is "from his Lord" and "from One All-Wise, All-Knowing". What a referee might say: "telâkki today means an understanding; the sense of receiving is dead, and the resemblance of roots is accidental" — the answer: the first sense in the *Kamus-ı Türkî* is "receiving, accepting", and p. 80 is exactly that sense; the overlap is not a game of etymology but two texts writing two different agents and sources for the same verb.

B.6 — tekâmül (evolution, perfecting)

- **In the books.** *tekâmül*: 9 (I pp. 5, 20, 22, 23, 24; II pp. 92, 118 (3)); *tekemmül*: 2 (I pp. 16, 22); *mütekâmil*: 3 (I pp. 4, 18; II p. 131). One word, one law: the biological transformation from fish to man on p. 5 ("came to their present form through evolution"), language on p. 22, religion on p. 23, and Islam itself on pp. 92 and 118 ("the evolution of the system of Islam") are all described with the same word. Page 118, by saying that the Prophet "did not consider himself bound by anything" in matters of religion, places evolution above the revealed text.
- **Examples.** *Tarih I, p. 5*: "Hulâsa insanlar, sularda kaynaşıp çırpınan bir mevcuttan, çok yavaş yürüyen bir tekâmülle, bugünkü şekle geldiler." [In sum, human beings came to their present form, through a very slowly proceeding evolution, from a being that swarmed and floundered in the waters.] — *Tarih I, p. 23*: "İnsanların hayatına taallûk eden her şeyde olduğu gibi dinî meselelerde de bir tekâmül hâdisesi görünür." [As in everything that concerns human life, a phenomenon of evolution is seen in religious matters too.]
- **Dictionary.** Kubbealtı *tekâmül*: "1. Olgunlaşma, olgunluk. 2. Zaman içinde meydana gelen gelişme, gelişim, evrim." [1. Maturing, maturity. 2. Development occurring over time; development, evolution.]; *tekâmülcülük*: "felsefî görüş, evrimcilik, tekâmüliye. Fr. Evolutionnisme." [A philosophical view; evolutionism. Fr. évolutionnisme.] Kamus-ı Türkî: no entry found (in the index of cagdassozluk.com, "tekâlîf" 38402 is followed by "tekebbüd" 38403; to be confirmed against a printed copy).
- **Shift of meaning.** Present, and the most marked shift: in 1931 "tekâmül" is the equivalent of Fr. *évolution* and covers biological evolution as well; it does not appear as an entry in the 1901 *Kamus-ı Türkî*, the term having become widespread at the beginning of the twentieth century. Today "evrim" is a separate word and "tekâmül" carries the connotation of maturing; without the context of p. 5, today's reader reads pp. 23 and 118 in a milder sense.
- **Qur'anic counterpart.** *akmala* (ك-م-ل) — to complete, to bring to perfection. Al-Mā'ida 5/3 "al-yawma akmaltu lakum dīnakum wa-atmamtu ʿalaykum niʿmatī" ‖ *aṭwār* (ط-و-ر) — stages; a creation whose agent is God. Nūḥ 71/14 "wa-qad khalaqakum aṭwārā" (Diyanet: "He created you passing through stages")
- **Overlap.** Exact at the level of the root (kamāl/ikmāl ↔ tekâmül), with opposite direction and agent: in the Qur'an religion has been "perfected" by God, whereas in the books religion and Islam "evolve" through society. What a referee might say: "Nūḥ 71/14, *aṭwār*, is compatible with evolution and does not contradict the books" — the review discusses not the mechanism but the agent; the verse names God as the agent, while the books say "a natural, necessary chemical and physical course". A second objection: "tekâmül means maturing, and p. 118 is praise" — the 1931 sense is *évolution*, and p. 118 places it above the revealed text.

B.7 — mefhum / bulmak / keşfetmek / icat (concept / to find / to discover / invention)

- **In the books.** *mefhum*: 9 (8 in I pp. 2-24; II p. 106); *bul-*: 25 (9 in I; 16 in II); *keşf-*: 13 (11 in I; 2 in II); *icat*: 5 (I pp. 7, 14, 22; II pp. 153, 165). "Mefhum" is neutral in the books; the weight is carried by the predicates: the rule on p. 2 counts all supernatural concepts "fabrications" for the human mind; p. 21 makes the beginning of the concept of God an "exalted ancestor"; p. 24 names human intelligence as the one that "found ... and discovered" the concept of divinity. "To find" carries both the sense of discovery (p. 4) and that of invention or laying down (the laws on p. 13).
- **Examples.** *Tarih I, p. 24*: "Ülûhiyet mefhumunu bulan, bu mefhumun sırlarını keşfeden ve bugün dahi keşfetmiye devam eden, insan zekâsıdır." [It is human intelligence that found the concept of divinity, that discovered the secrets of this concept, and that continues to discover them even today.] — *Tarih II, p. 89*: "Muhammet 40 yaşına geldiği zaman vatandaşlarını, kendinin bulduğu ve doğru olduğuna inandığı yeni bir dine davete başladı." [When Muhammad reached the age of forty he began to invite his fellow countrymen to a new religion that he had found himself and believed to be true.]
- **Dictionary.** Kubbealtı *bulmak* 3: "(Varlığı bilinmeyen veya mevcut olmayan bir şeyi) Ortaya çıkarmak, keşfetmek, îcat etmek" [To bring out, to discover, to invent (something whose existence is unknown or which does not exist)]; *îcat* 1: "Yeni bir şey bulma, ortaya koyma, varlığı bilinmeyen bir şeyi meydana getirme." [Finding something new, setting it forth, bringing into being something whose existence is unknown.] Kamus-ı Türkî *îcâd*: "Vücûda getirme, yoktan var etme, bulma, keşf, ihtirâ'" [Bringing into being, creating out of nothing, finding, discovery, invention]
- **Shift of meaning.** None for "mefhum" and "bulmak"; but in 1901 the *Kamus-ı Türkî* defines "îcâd" as "creating out of nothing, finding, discovery": "finding" and "invention" are synonymous, and for the 1931 reader "what he found himself" on p. 89 means "what he invented". In kalām the sense of "icat" as "creating out of nothing" belongs to God.
- **Qur'anic counterpart.** *lā yuḥīṭūna bihī ʿilmā* (ح-و-ط) — they cannot encompass Him in knowledge. Ṭā Hā 20/110 "wa-lā yuḥīṭūna bihī ʿilmā" ‖ *min tilqā'i nafsī* (س-ف-ن / ي-ق-ل) — of my own accord. Yūnus 10/15 "mā yakūnu lī an ubaddilahū min tilqā'i nafsī"
- **Overlap.** Strong, with opposite agents: "a new religion he found himself" ↔ "min tilqā'i nafsī"; "the concept of divinity" ↔ "lā yuḥīṭūna bihī ʿilmā". What a referee might say: "'to find/to discover' implies that what is found existed beforehand; the books do not contradict theism" — the answer: the rule on p. 2 and the "exalted ancestor" of p. 21 describe not discovery but construction; and in the 1901 dictionary "finding" is "îcâd".

B.8 — tabiat / tabiî / mahlûk / yaratmak (nature / natural / created being / to create)

- **In the books.** *tabiat*: 26 (22 in I pp. 1-24, three of them headings; II pp. 80, 91, 146, 156); *tabiî*: 12 (8 in I pp. 2-17; 4 in II); *mahlûk*: 13 (I pp. 2-23); *yarat-*: 9 (I pp. 3, 20, 23; II pp. 155-171). On p. 2 the books count nature "both the owner of the laws and subject to those same laws"; p. 5 ties life to a natural course "without the intervention of any agent outside nature". "Mahlûk" is used in the sense of "living creature" without any mention of a creator; "to create" occurs in a religious sense only on p. 3, with the qualifier "it used to be supposed", and in the books' own voice it is used of race and of the mind (p. 20).
- **Examples.** *Tarih I, p. 2*: "O halde tabiat hem kanunların sahibidir, hem de ayni kanunların tâbiidir." [Nature, then, is both the owner of the laws and subject to those same laws.] — *Tarih I, p. 2*: "Filhakika, insan, tabiatin mahlûkudur." [Indeed, the human being is the creature of nature.] — *Tarih I, p. 2*: "Tabiatte hiçbir şey yokolmaz ve hiçbir şey yoktan varolmaz." [In nature nothing perishes and nothing comes into being out of nothing.]
- **Dictionary.** Kubbealtı *mahlûk* 1: "Allah tarafından yaratılmış, yok iken var edilmiş." [Created by God, brought into being when it did not exist.] Kamus-ı Türkî *tabî'at* 1: "Yaradılıştaki hâl ve keyfiyet, hilkatin hâl ve hâssası, mâhiyet-i kâinât, dehr: Hâlik-ı tabîat olan Hazret-i Allah" [The state and

quality in creation, the state and property of the created order, the nature of the universe, time: God Most High, who is the Creator of nature]; 2: "Kâinâtın nizâm ve kānûn-ı hikmet-âmîzi" [The order of the universe and its wisdom-bearing law]

- **Shift of meaning.** Partly present: in 1901 "tabiat" carries the sense of creation and is "the order of the universe and its wisdom-bearing law" — the law itself, not its owner; the books make nature "the owner of the laws". Today the word "doğa" is used; "mahlûk" means "creature, living being" today as in the books, and the dictionaries' qualification "created by God" has been effaced in everyday usage.
- **Qur'anic counterpart.** *khalq* (خ-ل-ق) — to create, to bring into being out of nothing and with measure; the agent is God. Al-Mu'minūn 23/14 "fa-tabāraka'llāhu aḥsanu'l-khāliqīn"; Fāṭir 35/3 "hal min khāliqin ghayru'llāh" ‖ *badīʿ* (ب-د-ع) — the one who creates without a precedent; the contrary of the sentence "nothing comes into being out of nothing". Al-Baqara 2/117 "badīʿu's-samāwāti wa'l-arḍ"
- **Overlap.** Weak: the word "nature" does not occur in the Qur'an; the books' words "mahlûk" and "to create" take over the Qur'an's field of خ-ل-ق while changing the agent. What a referee might say: "'the creature of nature' is an idiom, and Muslim authors use it too; 'the law of nature' is in the *Kamus-ı Türkî* as well" — the answer: the books turn the idiom into a principle by means of the definition on p. 2 ("the owner of the laws") and the sentence "nothing comes into being out of nothing"; in the 1901 dictionary nature is the law itself, and its owner is "God Most High, who is the Creator of nature".

B.9 — din (religion)

- **In the books.** *din* (derivatives included): 93 (14 in I pp. 3-24; 79 in II pp. 79-176; five of them headings; the density is on pp. 84 and 89). The books' definition of "religion" is sociological and is given in stages on pp. 22-24: the first principles of religion arise out of fear (p. 22); to the "phenomenon" of the bond formed by "common customs and beliefs", "we today give the name of religion" (p. 23); religion is an institution "like the other social institutions" and one of "the principal formative forces" (p. 24). In *Tarih II* "religion" is plural and an institution ("the religion of Mūsā"; p. 89, "a new religion he found himself"); the oneness of the religions is transmitted only as something Muhammad "said" (p. 92).
- **Examples.** *Tarih I, p. 23*: "İşte bu hâdiseye biz bugün din namını veriyoruz." [It is to this phenomenon that we today give the name of religion.] — *Tarih II, p. 92*: "Muhammet davet ettiği dinin, kendinden evel, Musa, İsa ve sair peygamberler tarafından davet edilen İbrahim ve Tevhit dini olduğunu söylemiştir." [Muhammad said that the religion to which he invited people was the religion of Ibrāhīm and of tawḥīd, to which Mūsā, ʿĪsā and the other prophets had invited people before him.]
- **Dictionary.** Kubbealtı *din* 1: "İnsanların yaratıcı olarak kabul ettikleri üstün güce olan îmanlarını, ona yapacakları ibâdetlerin bütününü ve bu îmâna göre davranışlarının nasıl olması gerektiğini düzenleyen inanış yolu." [The way of belief that orders people's faith in the supreme power they accept as creator, the whole of the worship they are to offer to it, and how their conduct is to be in accordance with that faith.] Kamus-ı Türkî *dîn*: "Allâh'a ibâdet ve ma'neviyâta i'tikād husûsunda her milletin tuttuğu yol" [The way each nation follows in the worship of God and in belief in spiritual things]
- **Shift of meaning.** The dictionary meaning has not changed from 1901 to today; the shift is at the level of the books' definition: in the dictionaries religion is a way of faith and worship, whereas in the books it is a social "phenomenon" and "institution" brought forth by "common customs and beliefs" — the definition of the sociology of religion (Durkheim) that entered Turkish in 1931.
- **Qur'anic counterpart.** *dīn* (د-ي-ن) — obedience; judgement and reckoning; the way or order laid down by God. Āl ʿImrān 3/19 "inna'd-dīna ʿinda'llāhi'l-Islām"; Ash-Shūrā 42/13 "sharaʿa lakum mina'd-dīni mā waṣṣā bihī Nūḥan..." ‖ *dīn* (د-ي-ن; in the senses of reckoning and law) — the day of reckoning; the law of the sovereign. Al-Fātiḥa 1/4 "māliki yawmi'd-dīn"; Yūsuf 12/76 "fī dīni'l-malik"
- **Overlap.** Partial: the field of *dīn* in the Qur'an is wider than the books' "religion"; the common point is

the sense of "way, order". The Qur'an's use of "dīn" for other religions as well (Al-Kāfirūn 109/6) overlaps with the books' plural usage; the divergence is in the origin: in the Qur'an the one who lays religion down is God (Ash-Shūrā 42/13), in the books it is society. What a referee might say: "the books' definition is a sociological description, not a doctrinal claim" — the answer: the books deliver a judgement about origin with "it is seen that", and they place the concept of God in the same chain (p. 21).

Appendix C. The preface and the drafting-committee pages

This appendix gives the full text of the preface and the drafting-committee pages on which the first section of the review rests. These pages lie outside the hand-corrected corpus; for this appendix the text was copied out by reading the scan and was compared with the OCR output. The orthography is that of the 1931 printing. The preface of *Tarih II* is the same as that of *Tarih I*; there are only differences of spelling, shown below in square brackets. The scans are on the site, references **[5]** and **[6]**. The Turkish text is given first, and an English translation follows in square brackets.

C.1 — The citation pages

Tarih I **[3]**: "Maarif Vekâleti Millî Talim ve Terbiye Dairesinin 2/8/1931 tarih ve 1869 numaralı emrile 30 000 nüsha tab'edilmiştir." [Printed in 30,000 copies by order no. 1869, dated 2/8/1931, of the National Directorate of Instruction and Education of the Ministry of Education.]

Tarih II **[4]**: "Maarif Vekâleti Millî Talim ve Terbiye Dairesinin 28/11/1931 tarih ve 2847 numaralı emrile 25000 nüsha tab'edilmiştir." [Printed in 25,000 copies by order no. 2847, dated 28/11/1931, of the National Directorate of Instruction and Education of the Ministry of Education.]

C.2 — Mukaddime, the preface (*Tarih I*, pp. V–VI; *Tarih II*, pp. V–VI)

Son yıllara gelinceye kadar "Türk Tarihi" memleketimizde en az tetkik edilmiş mevzulardan biri halinde idi. [Until recent years "Turkish History" was one of the least studied subjects in our country.] 1000 yıldan fazla süren İslâmlık - Hıristiyanlık [II: islâmlık - hıristiyanlık] davalarının doğurduğu husumet duygusile mutaassıp müverrihler bu davalarda asırlarca islamlığın piştarlığını [II: islâmlığın pişdarlığını] yapan Türklerin tarihini kan ve ateş maceralarından ibaret göstermeğe savaştılar. Türk ve İslam müverrihler de Türklüğü ve Türk medeniyetini İslamlık ve İslam medeniyeti ile kaynaştırdılar; İslamlığa tekaddüm [II: islâmlığa takaddüm] eden binlerce yıla ait devreleri unutturmayı Ümmetçilik siyasetinin icabı ve din gayreti vecibesi bildiler. Daha yakın zamanlarda Osmanlı İmparatorluğuna dahil bütün unsurlardan tek bir milliyet yaratmak hayalini güden Osmanlılık [II: osmalılık] cereyanı da, Türk adının anılmaması, Millî Tarihin yalnız ihmal değil, hatta yazılmış olduğu sayfalardan [II: sayıfalardan] kazınıp silinmesi yolunda üçüncü bir amil halinde diğerlerine eklendi. [With the feeling of enmity born of the Islam–Christianity contests that lasted more than a thousand years, bigoted historians strove to present the history of the Turks — who for centuries were the vanguard of Islam in those contests — as consisting of nothing but adventures of blood and fire. Turkish and Muslim historians, for their part, fused Turkishness and Turkish civilisation with Islam and Islamic civilisation; they held it a requirement of the politics of the religious community, and an obligation of religious zeal, to have the periods belonging to the thousands of years preceding Islam forgotten. In more recent times the Ottomanist current, which cherished the dream of creating a single nationality out of all the elements contained in the Ottoman Empire, was added to the others as a third factor working towards the non-mention of the Turkish name and towards National History being not merely neglected but even scraped away and erased from the pages on which it had been written.] Bütün bu menfi cereyanlar, tabiî olarak, mektep programları ve mektep kitapları üzerinde dahi tesir gösterdi ve Türklüğün, çadır, aşiret, at, silâh ve muharebe mefhumlarile müradif tutulması an'anesi mektep kitaplarımıza kadar girdi. [All these negative currents naturally exerted their influence upon school curricula and school books as well, and the tradition of holding Turkishness to be synonymous with the notions of the tent, the tribe, the horse, the weapon and the battle made its way even into our school books.] Türk Tarihinin, inkâr edilmiş ve unutturulmuş simasını ve mahiyetini, bütün hakikatlerile meydana

çıkarabilmek için çalışmakta olan Türk Tarihi Tetkik Cemiyeti bir kısım azasını tarih tedrisatındaki bu boşluğu doldurabilecek bir kitap hazırlamağa memur etti [The Turkish Historical Research Society, which is working to bring to light, with all its truths, the countenance and the nature of Turkish History that have been denied and made to be forgotten, charged a number of its members with preparing a book capable of filling this gap in the teaching of history] En yeni eserlere ve Anadolu, Mısır, Mezopotamya, Ortaasya, Şimalî Hint, Şimalî Çin ve Cenubî Sibirde her gün [II: hergün] daha ileri götürülmekte olan arkeolojik tetkiklere istinat etmekle beraber mevzuun genişliği, zamanın darlığı yanında, önümüzdeki ders yılına yetiştirilmesi zaruretinin de hâkim bulunması ilcasile, bu küçük eserin ihtiyaca tam ve mükemmel şekilde tekabül edeceği iddia olunamaz. Noksanlar [II: Noksanları], ilerde, yeni basılışlarda tamamlanacaktır. Kitabın ihtiva ettiği mevzular etrafında daha fazla malûmat edinmek isteyenler [II: istiyenler] aynı [II: ayni] heyetin pek yakında bastırılmak üzere hazırladığı Umumî Türk Tarihinin Ana Hatları hakkındaki esere müracaat edebilirler. [Although it rests upon the most recent works and upon the archaeological investigations that are being carried further every day in Anatolia, Egypt, Mesopotamia, Central Asia, Northern India, Northern China and Southern Siberia, it cannot be claimed that this small work meets the need fully and perfectly, given the breadth of the subject and the shortness of the time, and given that the necessity of having it ready for the coming school year also prevailed. The deficiencies will be made good later, in new printings. Those who wish to obtain fuller information on the subjects the book contains may consult the work on the Main Lines of General Turkish History that the same committee has prepared and that is to be printed very shortly.] Cemiyet, dört kitap halinde hazırlamış olduğu bu küçük eseri, mekteplerde okutulmasını kabul eden Türkiye Cümhuriyeti Maarif Vekâletine hediye etmiştir. [The Society has presented this small work, which it has prepared in four books, to the Ministry of Education of the Republic of Turkey, which has accepted that it be taught in the schools.] Cemiyet, Maarif Vekâleti Neşriyat Müdürü Faik Reşit ve Devlet Matbaası Müdürü Hamdi Emin Beylere kitapların basılışındaki kıymetli yardımları için teşekkürü vecibe bilir. [The Society holds it an obligation to thank Faik Reşit Bey, Director of Publications of the Ministry of Education, and Hamdi Emin Bey, Director of the State Press, for their valuable assistance in the printing of the books.]

C.3 — "Kitabın hazırlanmasında çalışanlar", those who worked on the preparation of the book (*Tarih I*, pp. VII–VIII; *Tarih II*, pp. VII–VIII)

The titles are given in the wording of the 1931 printing, with an English rendering in square brackets.

Name	**Title in** *Tarih I*	**Difference in** *Tarih II*
Heyet reisi [head of the committee]	Riyaseticümhur Umumî Kâtibi ve Türk Tarihi Tetkik Cemiyeti Reisi [Secretary General of the Presidency of the Republic and President of the Turkish Historical Research Society]	—
Samih Rifat Bey	Çanakkale Meb'usu ve T. T. T. C. Reis Vekili [Deputy for Çanakkale and Vice-President of the Society]	—
Akçuraoğlu Yusuf Bey	İstanbul Meb'usu, Ankara Hukuk Mektebi Siyasî Tarih Profesörü ve T. T. T. C. Reis Vekili [Deputy for Istanbul, Professor of Political History at the Ankara School of Law and Vice-President of the Society]	—
Reşit Galip Bey	Aydın Meb'usu ve T. T. T. C. Umumî Kâtibi [Deputy for Aydın and Secretary General of the Society]	"Dr. Reşit Galip Bey"
Hasan Cemil Bey	Bolu Meb'usu ve T. T. T. C. Azası [Deputy for Bolu and member of the Society]	"Balıkesir Meb'usu" [Deputy for Balıkesir]
Afet Hanımefendi	Musiki Muallim Mektebi Tarih ve Medenî Bilgiler Muallimi ve T. T. T. C. Azası [Teacher of History and Civics at the Music Teachers' School and member of the Society]	—

Baki Bey	Erkânı Harbiye Miralayı, Büyük Erkânı Harbiye Harp Tarihi İkinci Şube Müdürü [Colonel of the General Staff, Director of the Second Branch for War History of the Grand General Staff]	—
İsmail Hakkı Bey	Balikesir Meb'usu ve T. T. T. C. Azası [Deputy for Balıkesir and member of the Society]	—
Reşit Saffet Bey	Kocaeli Meb'usu ve T. T. T. C. Azası [Deputy for Kocaeli and member of the Society]	—
Sadri Maksudi Bey	Şarkî Karahisar Meb'usu ve T. T. T. C. Azası [Deputy for Şarkî Karahisar and member of the Society]	"Ankara Hukuk Mektebi Profesörlerinden" [one of the professors of the Ankara School of Law] added
Şemseddin Bey	Sıvas Meb'usu ve İstanbul Darülfününu Türk Tarihi Sabık Profesörü ve T. T. T. C. Azası [Deputy for Sivas, former Professor of Turkish History at the University of Istanbul and member of the Society]	—
Şemsi Bey	Miralay, Harita Umum Müdürlüğü Harita Şubesi Müdürü [Colonel, Director of the Map Branch of the General Directorate of Maps]	—
Yusuf Ziya Bey	Eskişehir Meb'usu, İstanbul Darülfününu Hukuk Tarihi Sabık Profesörü ve T. T. T. C. Azası [Deputy for Eskişehir, former Professor of Legal History at the University of Istanbul and member of the Society]	—

Appendix D. The grounds of each judgement

This appendix shows, for each of the nineteen findings, **the claim it attributes to the books** and the sentences from which that claim comes. The type column makes two distinctions: **explicit** — the claim is present word for word in the books' wording; **combination** — the claim is built by bringing together more than one explicit sentence. Where a claim is a combination, the finding is obliged to show in its own text which sentences it is built from. The Qur'anic side of the findings falls outside this table: that is the criterion the review declares, not a claim attributed to the books.

Finding	Claim attributed to the books	Ground	Type
01	The birth of religion is tied to a human chain	The sequence of subheadings; "they invented", "this is the origin of", "we give the name of religion"	explicit
02	Religion, "like the other social institutions", is a human construction	Quote-05 (word for word)	explicit
03	Divinity is a concept built by human intelligence and reduced to nature	The book says "found / discovered"; the claim comes from the combination of Quote-10, Quote-01 and Quote-13	**combination**
04	The principle covers the whole of the unseen	The book says "all concepts above and outside nature" (Quote-10); "the unseen" is the review's term	**combination**
05	Primitive man has no religion; oneness comes later	Quote-11, Quote-12, Quote-13 — repeated without qualification in three places	explicit

06	The judgement is not descriptive but normative	"it must be accepted", "in any case" (Quote-15)	explicit
07	The origin is tied to nature; no agent outside nature is mentioned	Quote-15, Quote-16, Quote-17	explicit
08	The book does not transmit the claim of evolution but adopts it	"it becomes impossible not to accept" (Quote-22), "In sum (…) they came" (Quote-19)	explicit
09	The divine source belongs to a note of transmission, the human explanation to the book's own voice	The structure of the qualifiers in Quote-23 and Quote-24	explicit (structural)
10	The verses are "the product of reflections over a long period"	Quote-24, Quote-25, Quote-26 (word for word)	explicit
11	The Prophet is a "founder"; the description of proclamation is declared an "error"	Quote-28, Quote-29, Quote-30	explicit
12	The same pattern is extended to the whole of prophethood	Quote-31 is the only instance; the extension is built with the book's general thesis (Quote-05, Quote-34)	**combination**
13	The origin of belief in the jinn is culture	Quote-33: "Muhammad too (…) sincerely believed"	explicit
14	Belief in angels is nowhere recounted as truth	The qualifiers of Quote-23, Quote-34, Quote-35 and Quote-37	explicit (structural)
15	The Kaʿba narrative is declared "fabricated tales"	Quote-37: "All of these are, naturally, tales fabricated afterwards"	explicit
16	Sacredness is tied to a human and political ground	Quote-38, Quote-39, Quote-40	explicit
17	The perpetuity of the rulings is removed	The first sentence of Quote-42 (explicitness) and Quote-44	explicit
18	The praise remains within human categories	Quote-45, Quote-46; eight favourable sentences on pp. 90–93	explicit
19	"He supposed it revelation; what he said was the product of his own reflection"	The entailment of Quote-26 together with Quote-35	**combination**

In four findings (03, 04, 12, 19) the claim is built by combination, and in all four the finding says so in its own text. The single note on terminology, in Finding 04, is this: the field the book calls "all concepts above and outside nature" has been named in the review by the term "the unseen" (gayb).

Two sentences that do not appear in the table are not claims attributed to the books but assessments of the review itself, and are written as such in the findings: the judgement in Finding 03 that this "is a denial of divinity", and the sentence in Finding 11 that "the dilemma the book sets up is false".

This document, together with the review itself and its source text, has been released into the public domain under CC0 1.0.